Above the Law

A Study of Government Parking Permit Abuse in New York City
Executive Summary

This study examines the extent of government permit parking abuse over several hours of an average weekday in nine locations throughout New York City: Downtown and Prospect Heights in Brooklyn, Civic Center, Chinatown and Washington Heights in Manhattan, Concourse Village in the Bronx, Astoria and Jamaica in Queens and Saint George in Staten Island.

The study locations, each proximate to city, state and federal employment centers, were chosen based on community reports of rampant parking permit abuse. Included in these nine locations are streets around three NYPD police precincts that were surveyed by neighborhood volunteers who claimed that parking abuse by police in their communities was particularly egregious.

The survey found that citywide more than 3 out of every 4 permit holders (77%) used their permits illegally.

While government-issued permits allow holders to park in certain designated areas (these areas are more liberal for certain permit types, such as law enforcement), they do not allow holders to park anywhere they find space.

Unfortunately, when drivers with permits cannot find a legal spot, they often park in illegal spaces at the curbside and important metered spaces, hurting businesses that rely on parking turnover and sharply cutting into city revenues that would be generated by meters. Even more egregiously, many government workers endanger public safety by parking in front of fire hydrants, on sidewalks, in crosswalks, in intersections, and in bus stops.

In addition, illegal permit parking generates unnecessary traffic in several ways. First, due to their parking privileges, many commuters who could be taking transit opt to drive instead. Second, because they super-saturate the curb, illegal parkers cause other vehicles to troll to find ever-elusive curbside space. Third, when vehicles cannot find a spot, they double park, compounding traffic problems by blocking lanes and forcing erratic maneuvers. Fourth, illegal permit parking degrades the quality of the air that New Yorkers breathe, which contributes to increased risk of health problems like asthma, diabetes, heart disease, and cancer. Finally, illegal permit parking erodes the trust of government and law enforcement in the communities that are overrun by vehicles.

Permit Abuse

The widespread abuse of permits has persisted for decades. Without addressing the primary offenders of permit abuse, and without mandating that the NYPD halt what amounts to parking nonfeasance, the problem will fester. Time and again, privileged permit holders have demonstrated that they won’t obey the law. And because the NYPD does not consistently and equitably enforce parking laws, everyone who has a permit—legitimate or fraudulent—is encouraged to abuse the privilege. By default, the ability to abuse a parking permit has become a perk of holding certain government jobs.

Various studies that have preceded this one have shown that the findings herein are not anomalous. In 2003, City Councilmember David Yassky funded a study for the Atlantic Avenue Betterment Association (AABA) that demonstrated not only that the permit abusers along Atlantic Avenue in Downtown Brooklyn were taking needed meters, but that the abuse was continuous and perpetrated
consistently by the same permit holders. More stunningly, in July, 2006, in an NYPD Environmental Impact Statement analyzing the Park Row street closure around One Police Plaza, the **NYPD's own surveyors found that 1217 cars parked illegally** on the streets around One Police Plaza. Of those, **1012 were private commuter vehicles with city-issued permits.**

Though it may not be explicit policy, the NYPD's traffic enforcement division essentially operates under the premise that citywide there is a "no hit" policy on vehicles with permits in the window. Permit abusers talk of the NYPD extending a "courtesy" to agencies to break the law; business owners and Business Improvement Districts relay accounts of local enforcement officers repeatedly refusing to give tickets to permit holders while ticketing non-permit holders parked in their midst.

During the course of the study, every one of Transportation Alternative's 22 surveyors was questioned and asked for ID (two were detained briefly) by law enforcement officers looking out for their own interest and ensuring "courtesy" for others.

**Permit Reduction**

While Mayor Bloomberg has vowed to reduce the number of permits on the street, the problem persists. Transportation Alternatives estimates that over 150,000 drivers have access to free parking in the form of valid government-issued parking permits (including the more than 30,000 NYPD "Self-Enforcement Zone" permits and 75,000 teacher permits). Thousands more illicitly enjoy the same privileges by photocopying permits, or by minting their own. In part because of this parking privilege, census data clearly show that government workers drive to work at two times the rate of private sector workers.

Yet, even before he became Mayor, on July 11th, 2001, in a campaign-trail policy paper, Michael Bloomberg vowed, if elected, to

> [c]urb privileged parking…. Curb space is a valuable public resource. There may be as many as 100,000 on-street parking permits issued to city, state and federal employees, judges, diplomats, the press, etc. The fact that no one knows the exact number points to an aspect of this problem. Privileges should be rescinded unless there is a demonstrable need for on-street parking. If the average person doesn’t have special parking privileges, why should those who work for us or write about the traffic “mess” have them?

Five years later, when confronted about continual permit abuse in a press conference (August 9th, 2006), Mayor Bloomberg asserted:

> I’ve always been a believer that everybody should be treated the same. And if we are going to have parking placards, we should have parking placards for the people who the city employees--including me--work for, not for the city employees. We’ve got this mixed up. We’re supposed to be providing services and support for the public…. But having said that, we have parking laws, we have signs up. Everybody should obey them.

---

1. Revenue Potential From Reduced Commuting by Government Workers to the Manhattan Central Business District, Schaller Consulting. 2006
While Mayor Bloomberg deserves credit for reducing Agency Business Parking Permits (ABPP) by about 30% since 2002 (approximately 3,000 permits eliminated), and limiting the number of permits issued by the Mayor's office (from 170 to 137 since 2004), these reductions barely impact the total number of permits on the streets and represent an insignificant fraction of the illegal permits found in this study.

**Overview of Results**

- **Citywide, more than 3 out of every 4 permit holders (77%) used their permits illegally.**
- Citywide, the NYPD was responsible for 46% of illegal permit abuse, by far the largest share from any single agency.
- Of valid permits used illegally at the curbside (i.e. illegally parking at signs with riders forbidding that particular permit's usage), the NYPD was responsible for 63% of the abuse.
- Of the 369 total citywide violations in this study that caused safety hazards, there were 212 permit holders on sidewalks, 46 blocking fire hydrants, 23 in crosswalks, 22 in bus stops, 8 in intersections, and 10 in bike lanes. The NYPD led the way with 61% of the total abuses.
- The NYPD were the leading abusers of permits using up meters, with 28% of the total.
- Court Officers were responsible for the majority of fraudulent permits with 54% of the total, followed by Corrections, Court Clerks, and FDNY. This was in large part due to the proliferation of union-issued permits for these agencies, which are not legal on New York City streets.

**Recommendations**

While the recently announced $400,000 Department of Transportation study of parking and permit abuse in downtown Manhattan is a positive step toward better understanding parking patterns, the Mayor need not wait for another study to begin upholding the law and reducing the numbers of permits in circulation. The Mayor and the NYPD should immediately implement the following recommendations that would ameliorate the problem overnight:

- **Enforce the Law**
- **Take Inventory of Permits and Reduce the Total**
- **Educate Government Workers to Eliminate the "Culture of Entitlement"**
- **Update Parking Signage to Reflect the Communities' Needs**

---

2 See page 8 for an Overview of Results
3 See page 11 for detailed Recommendations
# Table of Contents

- Executive Summary: 2
- Table of Contents: 5
- Purpose and Methodology: 6
- Detailed Citywide Results: 8
- Recommendations: 11
- Municipal Centers and Precincts Title Page: 14
- Downtown Brooklyn: 15
- Civic Center, Manhattan: 19
- Chinatown, Manhattan: 23
- Concourse Village, The Bronx: 27
- Jamaica, Queens: 31
- St. George, Staten Island: 35
- 114th Precinct, Astoria, Queens: 39
- 78th Precinct, Prospect Heights, Brooklyn: 40
- 34th Precinct, Washington Heights, Manhattan: 41
Purpose and Methodology

Purpose

The availability of parking is one of the primary factors that determines whether people drive or take transit. Therefore, cheap parking induces more driving. In New York City, where space is extremely limited, and where public transportation is available at all hours to mitigate street congestion, parking availability is widely regarded among policy experts as the determining factor whether a person drives or takes alternative modes.

While no single city, state, or federal agency can accurately estimate the total number of parking permits in use on the streets, by collating information from previous accountings, Freedom of Information Law (FOIL) requests, and internal memos leaked from various agencies, Transportation Alternatives estimates that there are over 150,000 valid permits issued by the New York City Department of Transportation, the NYPD, the New York City Department of Education, the various New York State Law Enforcement and Government agencies, and Federal Law Enforcement agencies. In addition, there are large numbers of fake permits, expired permits, and any number of disparate objects like bibles, PBA cards, US Marine Corps patches, American flags, notes with telephone numbers to traffic agents seeking clemency, etc. placed on dashboards in order to avoid ticketing (almost all had avoided ticketing during the hours of this study).

While government-issued permits allow the holder to park in certain designated areas (these areas are more liberal for certain permit types, such as law enforcement), they do not allow the holder to park anywhere they find space. When drivers with permits cannot find a legal spot, they often park in illegal spaces at the curbside and important metered spaces, which hurts businesses that rely on parking turnover and sharply cuts into city revenues that would be generated by the meters. Even more egregiously, many government workers endanger public safety by parking in front of fire hydrants, on sidewalks, in crosswalks, in intersections, and in bus stops.

Moreover, illegal permit parking leads to increased cruising for scarce parking spaces and decreases the likelihood that delivery vehicles will be able to reach the curbside, thus compounding double parking. Illegal permit parking degrades the quality of the air that New Yorkers breathe, which leads to increased risk of health problems like asthma, diabetes, heart disease, and cancer. Finally, illegal permit parking erodes the trust in government and law enforcement in the communities that are overrun by vehicles.

Methodology

On Wednesday morning, June 21, 2006, Transportation Alternatives surveyed the extent of permit parking abuse in nine neighborhoods throughout the five boroughs. Teams of researchers walked the streets of Downtown and Prospect Heights in Brooklyn, Civic Center, Chinatown and Washington Heights in Manhattan, Concourse Village in the Bronx, Astoria and Jamaica in Queens and Saint George in Staten Island.

22 Transportation Alternatives researchers canvassed streets in neighborhoods based on complaints from community residents and subscribers to our weekly E-bulletin. Surveyors started surveying at 9 am and surveyed from 1-4 hours, depending on the location and extent of permit usage. Given the high number of permits issued by city, state, and federal agencies, and the ubiquity of counterfeit permits and related abuse throughout the city, this study was not able to document permit abuse on all city streets. Therefore, this study serves as a snapshot of the larger problem.

The study analyzed permits by agency and by location according to the following criteria:

- Total permits used illegally:
  - Of the illegal permits, the study further analyzed:
    - How many permits were used illegally at the curb (e.g. NYPD permit holders parked at a "No Standing Except for District Attorney" sign)
    - How many permits were used in a manner that endangered public safety (e.g. parking in front of fire hydrants, on sidewalks, in crosswalks and intersection, and in bus stops)
    - How many permits were fraudulent or were not recognized in New York City
- Total permits used legally
- Permits used legally and illegally at meters
- Permits with insufficient data to determine parking legality (e.g. Agency Business Parking Permits or Law Enforcement Permits that may have been on official business within the time limits accorded by those permits)

Transportation Alternatives thanks all the communities impacted by permit parking abuse throughout the city for their insight into developing study locations and relevant details. We are indebted to the surveyors for volunteering their time to survey the streets and enter the enormous quantities of data generated subsequently. In addition, special thanks to Mike Infranco, Graham Beck, Wiley Norvell, Mark Stonehill, Kate Edmundson, Will Sherman, and Matthew Roth for their invaluable contributions to the completion of the study.
Detailed Citywide Results

Total Permits Used Legally and Illegally 2299
Permits Used Illegally 1777 - 77% of Total Permits
Permits Used Legally 522 - 23% of Total Permits
Permits Used at Meters 392

NOTE: For all following data: DOT refers to both NYC DOT permits and Agency Business Parking Permits issued by the NYC DOT to other agencies.

Permits Used Illegally by Agency

Permits Used Legally by Agency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Permits Used Illegally</th>
<th>Permits Used Legally</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>822</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYSPD</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBI</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1777</td>
<td>522</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Permits Used at Meters by Agency

Valid Permits Used Illegally at the Curbside by Agency

Permits Causing Safety Hazard by Agency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Attorney</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NY State Ex. Branch</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Law Enf.</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYSPD</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBI</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probation</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>946</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYSPD</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bklyn. Boro Pres.</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Fraudulent Permits by Agency

- **Court Officer**: 276
- **Correction**: 61
- **Court Clerk**: 53
- **FDNY**: 49
- **MTA**: 20
- **NYPD**: 6
- **Other**: 47
- **Total**: 512

### Insufficient Data to Determine Legality by Agency

- **DOT**: 36
- **NYPD**: 13
- **BK Courts**: 9
- **NYC Official Bus.**: 6
- **HPD**: 5
- **Dept. of Buildings**: 3
- **Other**: 11
- **Total**: 83
Recommendations

There is a culture of parking entitlement among government workers that has serious and damaging impacts on city streets, on relations between the public and the government, and on commercial and neighborhood vitality. Not only does permit abuse degrade quality of life, in many cases it creates dangerous public safety hazards by inhibiting municipal functioning and emergency response. Because the NYPD does not consistently and equitably enforces parking laws, everyone who has a permit—legitimate or fraudulent—is encouraged to abuse the privilege.

Further, there are numerous stories of retribution by permit holders against community members who speak up about the abuse, shop owners who petition government workers to stop abusing their privilege, and even traffic enforcement agents who attempt to do the right thing and uphold the law.

Various studies that have preceded this one have shown that the findings herein are not anomalous. In 2003, City Councilmember David Yassky funded a study for the Atlantic Avenue Betterment Association (AABA) that demonstrated both that the permit abuse along Atlantic Avenue in Downtown Brooklyn was taking needed meters, but that the abuse was continuous and perpetrated consistently by the same permit holders. More stunningly, in July, 2006, in an NYPD Environmental Impact Statement analyzing the Park Row street closure around One Police Plaza, the NYPD's own surveyors found that 1217 cars parked illegally on the streets around One Police Plaza. Of those, 1012 were private commuter vehicles with city issued permits.

Though it may not be explicit policy, the NYPD's traffic enforcement division essentially operates under the premise that citywide there is a "no hit" policy on vehicles with permits in the window. Permit abusers talk of the NYPD extending a "courtesy" to agencies to break the law; business owners and Business Improvement Districts relay accounts of local enforcement officers repeatedly refusing to give tickets to permit holder while ticketing non-permit holders parked in their midst. This widespread abuse of permits goes back decades and no recent mayors have been willing to deal with the problem. The ability to abuse a parking permit is an implicit perk of holding certain government jobs.

During the course of the study, every one of Transportation Alternative's 22 surveyors was questioned and asked for ID (two were detained briefly) by law enforcement officers looking out for their own interest and ensuring "courtesy" for others.

Given the severity of the problem, the Mayor and the Commissioner of the NYPD must implement the following recommendations immediately.

Enforce the Law
The simplest and most effective solution for ending this pandemic of privilege and abuse is to mandate that the NYPD enforce existing traffic laws. No one should be above the law, especially the agencies sworn to uphold it. While many government workers from a range of government agencies break the law, only the NYPD has the power to enforce it. Now that all traffic enforcement officers have been consolidated under this agency, the matter should be simple—if only the NYPD were forced to do its job.

Permit holders who abuse their permits should immediately be ticketed, not issued warnings. If they continue to abuse their permits, they should be towed, just as any other vehicle would. Bearers of
fraudulent permits should be ticketed and those permit holders should be prosecuted to the full extent of the law. Further, unions representing Court Officers, Corrections, Court Clerks, FDNY, and others should be mandated to immediately stop printing fraudulent parking permits for their membership and pull existing fraudulent permits off the streets.

Traffic enforcement agents should be required to enforce parking laws, not intimidated by high-ranking officers when they do. In addition, the Commissioner and Chief of Transportation for the NYPD should send a clear signal that enforcement of traffic laws is a priority for the entire agency, thus empowering enforcement officers and assuring the public that the police really abide by and respect the law.

**Take Inventory of Permits and Reduce the Total**
Alarmingly, the city has not accounted for the total number of permits issued by all agencies, nor does it seem willing to get fraudulent and expired permits off the streets. In a document prepared for former Deputy Mayor Marc Shaw in early 2002, the NYC DOT inventoried permits issued by its offices, as well as city, state, and federal law enforcement agencies. Yet, even in this analysis, no mention was made of the more than 30,000 "Self-Enforcement Zone" permits, the 75,000 teacher permits, or any other agency that may print its handful of permits. And no mention was made of the abundance of fraudulent, union issue, and non-NYC-recognized permits.

While Mayor Bloomberg deserves credit for reducing Agency Business Parking Permits (ABPP) by about 30% since 2002 (approximately 3,000 permits eliminated), and limiting the number of permits issued by the Mayor's office (from 170 to 137 since 2004), these reductions represent a small percentage of the total number of permits on the streets and represent an insignificant fraction of the illegal permits found in this study.

Transportation Alternatives recommends that Mayor Bloomberg create a publicly available database on the city's website that shows the total number of permits issued by all agencies and recognized by the City of New York as legal. This should include city, state, and federal law enforcement agencies, the DOT, the Department of Education, the NYPD's "Self-Enforcement Zone" permits, and any agencies or departments that print their own permits, such as Borough Presidents. The city should track permit abuse problems as a specific 311 complaint and publish a continuous tally of abuse by neighborhood.

In addition, the City should establish strict, uniform, and transparent standards by which a permit holder can obtain a government-issued permit, such as stringent safeguards around the issuance of DOT Disability permits; those who do not meet the warrants should not be issued permits. Likewise, the city should take a regular inventory throughout the city every six months to one year--similar to the survey conducted for the One Police Plaza Environmental Impact Statement referenced above--that shows the extent of permit parking abuse in the effort to curb the problem.

**Educate Government Workers to Eliminate the "Culture of Entitlement"**
Because Permit Parking has long been seen as a victimless violation and a perk of the job, the city needs to educate municipal workers and New Yorkers in general about the real cost and impact of parking and illegal permit parking. Holders of legitimate permits must understand that parking on sidewalks, in front of fire hydrants, in crosswalks and intersections, in bike lanes and in bus stops
endangers pedestrians, cyclists, and drivers, and inhibits municipal functioning such as bus movement and emergency response.

Further, while unions such as the Policeman's Benevolent Association have long called for the right of its membership to have parking spaces near precincts, this privilege should not conflict with the safety of the neighborhood where the precincts are located. Permits should only be used for essential personnel on official business; commuting to work by private vehicle must not be considered "official business."

Police officers and other government workers insist that they have a contractual "right" to park their cars for free, though nowhere in contracts made available to Transportation Alternatives was the city contractually obliged to guarantee a free parking space for every police officer's private vehicle. In addition, because law enforcement agents can ride public transportation for free, limiting parking for private commuter vehicles will not hinder their ability to get to and from work. Further, given that the study found so few official vehicles (and so many commuter vehicles) parked illegally, the argument that this parking perk is necessary to do the job is dubious.

Some government employees may need assistance in changing their travel behavior. Many cities have found success in “personalized travel planning” programs that help drivers identify and adopt alternatives. These programs, in addition to providing information about the cost savings and viability of alternatives, can also serve to facilitate car pooling and ridesharing among employees.

**Update Parking Signage to Reflect the Communities' Needs**

While the NYPD bears the biggest responsibility for fixing the problem, the NYC Department of Transportation should be more responsive to community input around parking signage. In Brooklyn, various community boards have sought innovative parking changes, such as Residential Parking Permits or "Hunting Licenses" that would give the residents living in an area first shot at a parking space.

At a minimum, however, the DOT must update "No Standing Except Authorized Agency" signs to guarantee that each contains the required rider that indicates which agency is authorized to park in the designated area. The study found over 225 vehicles parked at these signs, which all manner of agency permits used. This lack of specific parking limitations encourages any permit holder who considers himself/herself an "authorized" agency representative to use the spaces with impunity.
Municipal and Commercial Centers

Downtown, Brooklyn
Civic Center and Chinatown, Manhattan
Concourse Village, The Bronx
Jamaica, Queens
St. George, Staten Island

Precincts

114th Precinct, Astoria, Queens
78th Precinct, Prospect Heights, Brooklyn
34th Precinct, Washington Heights, Manhattan
Census Tracts: 9, 37, 43, 41, 27, 11, 13, 25

Streets Walked: Livingston, Schermerhorn, State, Pacific, Gold, Pearl, Jay, Bridge, Duffield, Lawrence, Court, Adams, Smith, Hoyt, Nevins, Bond, Montague, Pierrepoint, Middagh, Boerum, Remsen, Joralemon, Clinton; Red Hook Lane, Aitken Place, Atlantic Avenue, Brooklyn Bridge Boulevard, Cadman Plaza

Facilities in the Area:

1) Brooklyn Borough Hall: 209 Joralemon Street
2) Brooklyn Municipal Building: 210 Joralemon Street
3) Main Post Office, Brooklyn: 271-301 Cadman Plaza East
4) Main Courthouse: 360 Adams Street
5) 84th Police Precinct: 301 Gold Street
6) NYC Fire Department and EMS: 9 Metrotech Center
7) Brooklyn Family Court: 238 Adams Street
8) NYC Transit Headquarters: 370 Jay Street
9) Department of Motor Vehicles: 10 Metrotech Center
10) Brooklyn House of Detention for Men: 275 Atlantic Ave
11) Brooklyn House of Detention Center: 121 DeKalb Avenue
Detailed Results

Total Permits Used Legally and Illegally  849
Permits Used Illegally        587  -69% of Total Permits
Permits Used Legally         262  -31% of Total Permits
Permits Used at Meters    163

Permits Used Illegally by Agency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYSPD</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>587</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Permits Causing Safety Hazards by Agency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brooklyn Boro Pres.</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Law Enf.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYSPD</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Fraudulent Permits by Agency

- Court Officer: 99
- FDNY: 49
- Correction: 30
- Court Clerk: 17
- MTA: 14
- Other: 20
- Total: 229

### Permits Used at Meters by Agency

- NYPD: 64
- DOT: 29
- Court Officer: 17
- Federal Law Enf.: 11
- District Attorney: 7
- MTA: 6
- Other: 29
- Total: 163

### Permits Used Legally by Agency

- NYPD: 99
- DOT: 58
- NYSPD: 31
- District Attorney: 13
- Federal Law Enf.: 11
- FDNY: 7
- MTA: 6
- Other: 37
- Total: 262
DOT 20
BK Courts 9
NYC Official Bus. 5
NYPD 5
Other 6
Total 45

It is insufficient to determine legality by agency.
Census Tracts: 33, 21

Streets Walked: Elk, Center, Chambers, Reade, Duane, Thomas, Worth, Leonard, Franklin Streets; West Broadway, Broadway

Facilities in the Area:

1) City Hall
2) The Municipal Building: 1 Centre Street
3) Police Department Main Headquarters: 1 Police Plaza
4) Federal Plaza: Broadway between Worth and Duane Streets
5) U.S. Courthouse: 40 Foley Square
6) Surrogates Court, Municipal Archives: 31 Chambers Street
7) Tweed Courthouse: 52 Chambers Street
8) New York City Department of City Planning: 22 Reade Street
9) Engine 7, Ladder 1: 100 Duane Street
10) Satellite Academy: 51 Chambers Street
Detailed Results

Total Permits Used Legally and Illegally 392
Permits Used Illegally 336 -86% of Total Permits
Permits Used Legally 45 -14% of Total Permits
Permits Used at Meters 11

NYPD 181
DOT 86
FBI 23
FDNY 23
Probation 7
Other 16
Total 336

Valid Permits Used Illegally at the Curbside by Agency

NYPD 179
DOT 80
FBI 23
FDNY 20
Other 7
Total 309
Permits Causing Safety Hazards by Agency

- DOT 20%
- FDNY 20%
- Probation 15%
- Court Clerk 10%
- Juvenile Justice 15%
- NYPD 10%
- Other 10%
- Total 20

Permits Used at Meters by Agency

- DOT 55%
- NYPD 45%
- Total 11

Fraudulent Permits by Agency

- Court Clerk 45%
- Court Officer 33%
- Correction 11%
- DOT 11%
- Total 9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probation</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juvenile Justice</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>20</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>9</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Permits Used Legally by Agency

- **NYPD**: 24
- **DOT**: 7
- **Dept. of Buildings**: 1
- **Film**: 1
- **US Dept of State**: 1
**Total**: 34

Insufficient Data to Determine Legality by Agency

- **DOT**: 11
- **DEP**: 1
- **Juvenile Justice**: 1
- **NYC Official Bus.**: 1
- **NYPD**: 1
**Total**: 15
Chinatown, Manhattan

Census Tract: 29

Streets Walked: Centre, Baxter, Mulberry, Mott, Elizabeth, Mosco, Leonard, Bayard, Walker Streets; Hogan Place

Facilities in the Area:

1) 5th Police Precinct: 19 Elizabeth Street
2) Chinatown Station Post Office: 6 Doyers Street
3) Engine 9: 75 Canal Street
4) New York Public Library, Chatham Square Branch: 33 East Broadway
5) PS 130 - Hernando DeSoto School (K-5): 143 Baxter Street
6) PS 42 - Benjamin Altman School (K-5): 71 Hester Street
7) PS 124 - Yung Wing School (K-5): 40 Division Street
8) PS 1 - Alfred E. Smith School (K-5): 8 Henry Street
9) Pace High School: 100 Hester Street
10) Gouverneur Hospital: 227 Madison Street
Detailed Results

Total Permits Used Legally and Illegally 223
Permits Used Illegally 196 -88% of Total Permits
Permits Used Legally 27 -12% of Total Permits
Permits Used at Meters 9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Permits Used Illegally</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NY State Ex. Branch</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYSPD</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dept of Health</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>124</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Permits Used Illegally by Agency

- NYPD: 62%
- Court Officer: 11%
- NYSPD: 7%
- Funeral: 5%
- NY State Ex. Branch: 3%
- Other: 12%

Valid Permits Used Illegally at the Curbside by Agency

- NYPD: 86%
- NY State Ex. Branch: 5%
- NYSPD: 2%
- Dept of Health: 5%
- Other: 3%

- Total 196
### Permits Causing Safety Hazards by Agency

- **NYPD**: 45%
- **NYSPD**: 3%
- **Funeral**: 17%
- **Court Officer**: 3%
- **Court Clerk**: 6%
- **Film**: 3%

### Fraudulent Permits by Agency

- **Court Officer**: 54%
- **School of Trans.**: 10%
- **Court Clerk**: 13%
- **Funeral**: 10%
- **Other**: 10%

### Permits Used at Meters by Agency

- **NYPD**: 56%
- **Construction**: 11%
- **Court Clerk**: 11%
- **Funeral**: 22%

---

**Performance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYSPD</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funeral</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>35</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Fraudulent Permits**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School of Trans.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funeral</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>39</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Permits Used at Meters**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funeral</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>9</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Permits Used Legally by Agency

- NYPD: 63%
- Film: 19%
- Construction: 7%
- DOT: 7%
- Funeral: 4%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Permits Used Legally</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funeral</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>27</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Concourse Village, The Bronx

Census Tracts: 59.01, 59.02

Streets Walked: 158th, 159th, 161st, 162nd Streets; Sherman, Walton, Sheridan, Grant Avenues; Grand Concourse

Facilities in the Area:

1) Bronx Borough Hall: 851 Grand Concourse
2) Bronx County Courthouse: 851 Grand Concourse
3) Bronx Borough President’s Office: 851 Grand Concourse
4) Yankee Stadium: East 161st Street and River Avenue
5) New York Public Library, Melrose Branch: 910 Morris Avenue
6) Montefiore Medical Center: 305 East 161st St
7) P.S. 35 – Franz Siegel School (K-4): 261 East 163rd St
8) PS 156 - Benjamin Banneker School (Pre K-6): 750 Concourse Village West
9) Cardinal Hayes High School: 650 Grand Concourse
10) Bronx High School for Law, Government and Justice: 244 E 163rd St
Detailed Results

Total Permits Used Legally and Illegally 225
Permits Used Illegally 191 85% of Total Permits
Permits Used Legally 34 15% of Total Permits
Permits Used at Meters 15

Permits Used Illegally by Agency

- NYPD 75
- Court Officer 60
- NYSPD 37
- Correction 5
- DOT 5
- Other 9
- Total 191

Permits Used Legally by Agency

- NYPD 6
- Court Officer 1
- NYSPD 25
- DOT 2
- Other 1
- Bronx Borough Pres. 1
- Total 34
Permits Used at Meters by Agency

- Court Officer: 13%
- NYPD: 70%
- Bronx Borough President: 7%
- Total: 15%

Valid Permits Used Illegally at the Curbside by Agency

- NYPD: 57%
- NYSPD: 4%
- DOT: 4%
- Court Officer: 4%
- Other: 4%
- Total: 109

Permits Causing Safety Hazards by Agency

- NYPD: 59%
- Court Officer: 21%
- Correction: 5%
- District Attorney: 5%
- DOT: 5%
- NYSPD: 5%
- Total: 19
**Insufficient Data to Determine Legality**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Fraudulent Permits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NY State Ex. Branch</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total:** 67

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Fraudulent Permits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total:** 7
Jamaica, Queens

Census Tracts: 244, 240, 446.01, 446.02, 276, 460, 238

Streets Walked: 88th, 89th, 90th, 91st, Archer Avenue, Jamaica Avenue; 146th, 153rd, 160th Streets, Sutphin Blvd

Facilities in the Area:

1) 103rd Police Precinct: 168-02 91 Ave
2) Engine Company 233 and Ladder Company 176: 82-68 164th St.
3) Queensborough Public Library, Central Branch: 89-11 Merrick Boulevard
4) Kings Manor Museum: 90-04 161 Street
5) Hillcrest High School: 160-05 Highland Ave
6) Jamaica High School: 167-01 Gothic Dr.
7) P.S. 86: 87-41 Parsons Blvd.
8) P.S. 182: 90-36 150 St.
9) Mary Immaculate Hospital: 90-10 150th St
10) Jamaica Station: Sutphin Blvd and Archer Avenue
Detailed Results

Total Permits Used Legally and Illegally 198
Permits Used Illegally 150 -76% of Total Permits
Permits Used Legally 48 -24% of Total Permits
Permits Used at Meters 80

Permits Used Illegally by Agency

- NYPD 30
- Probation 7
- NYSPD 3
- Education 1
- NYST 1
- USPS 1
- Total 43

Permits Used Illegally at the Curbside by Agency

- NYPD 71%
- Probation 2%
- NYSPD 2%
- Education 2%
- NYST 2%
- USPS 2%
- Total 150

NYPD 45
Court Officer 44
Court Clerk 20
Correction 18
Probation 7
Other 16
Total 150

NYPD 30
Probation 7
NYSPD 3
Education 1
NYST 1
USPS 1
Total 43
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Permits Used Legally</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Gov.</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>48</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Permits Used Legally by Agency**

- **NYPD**: 66%
- **Social Security**: 10%
- **DOT**: 8%
- **Federal Gov.**: 8%
- **Other**: 8%
Census Tract: 3

Streets Walked: Hyatt, Bay, Hamilton Streets; Central Avenue, Stuyvesant Place, St. Mark’s Place, Richmond Terrace

Facilities in the Area:

1) St. George Ferry and Bus Terminal: 1 Bay Street
2) Staten Island Borough Hall: 10 Richmond Terrace
3) Staten Island County Courthouse: 18 Richmond Terrace
4) Borough President’s Office: 120 Borough Hall
5) 120th Precinct: 78 Richmond Terrace
6) The Staten Island Museum: 75 Stuyvesant Place
7) The Richmond County Bank Ballpark: 2025 Richmond Avenue
8) The United States Coast Guard Station: 1 Bay Street
9) New York Public Library, St. George Branch: 5 Central Avenue
10) St. George Station Post Office: 45 Bay Street
Detailed Results

Total Permits Used Legally and Illegally: 187
- Permits Used Illegally: 100 (-53% of Total Permits)
- Permits Used Legally: 87 (-47% of Total Permits)

Permits Used at Meters: 114

Permits Used Illegally by Agency:
- Court Officer: 49
- NYPD: 16
- Court Clerk: 16
- Correction: 5
- District Attorney: 4
- Children's Services: 3
- Other: 16
- Total: 100

Valid Permits Used Illegally at the Curbside by Agency:
- NYPD: 6
- Children's Services: 3
- District Attorney: 3
- S.I Borough Pres.: 1
- HPD: 1
- NY State Ex. Branch: 1
- Total: 15

Diagram showing the distribution of permits used illegally by agency.
Permits Causing Safety Hazards by Agency

- Court Officer: 42%
- NYPD: 4%
- District Attorney: 4%
- Housing: 4%
- PBA: 4%
- Probation: 4%
- Total: 24%

Fraudulent Permits by Agency

- Court Officer: 68%
- Court Clerk: 7%
- Correction: 7%
- PBA: 8%
- MTA: 3%
- Other: 4%
- Total: 72%

Permits Used at Meters by Agency

- District Attorney: 23%
- Court Officer: 16%
- DOT: 10%
- NY State Exec. Branch: 9%
- Children's Services: 7%
- NYPD: 7%
- Correction: 7%
- Court Clerk: 4%
- Other: 4%
- Total: 114

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBA</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTA</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>72</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>District Attorney</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Officer</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NY State Ex. Branch</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children's Services</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYPD</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correction</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court Clerk</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>114</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Permits Used Legally by Agency

- District Attorney: 31%
- DOT: 13%
- NY State Ex. Branch: 11%
- NYPD: 10%
- Children's Services: 9%
- Other: 26%

Insufficient Data to Determine Legality by Agency

- DOT: 62%
- Dept. of Buildings: 25%
- Housing: 13%

Summary of Permits Used Legally:

- District Attorney: 26
- DOT: 11
- NY State Ex. Branch: 10
- NYPD: 9
- Children's Services: 8
- Other: 23
- Total: 87

Summary of Insufficient Data:

- DOT: 5
- Dept. of Buildings: 2
- Housing: 1
- Total: 8
Census Tracts: 65, 67

Streets Walked: 34th, 35th Streets, Astoria Blvd. South

Facilities in the Area:

1) 114th Police Precinct: 34-16 Astoria Blvd
2) Mount Sinai Hospital of Queens: 25-10 30th Avenue
4) P.S. 85: The Judge Charles J. Vallone School: 23-70 31 Street
5) P.S. 70: 30-45 42nd Street
78th Precinct, Prospect Heights, Brooklyn

Census Tracts: 161, 129.02

Streets Walked: 6th Avenue, Dean, Bergen Streets

Facilities in the Area:

1) LIRR Flatbush Avenue Terminal: Atlantic Avenue and Flatbush Avenues
1) 78th Police Precinct
2) Brooklyn Public Library, Pacific Branch: 25 Fourth Ave.
3) Grand Army Plaza Green Market
4) Brooklyn High School of the Arts: 345 Dean St.
34th Precinct - Washington Heights, Manhattan

Census Tract: 271

Streets Walked: 181st, 182nd, 183rd, 184th Streets, Broadway

Facilities in the Area:

1) 34th Precinct, NYPD: 4295 Broadway
2) Engine 93, Ladder 45, Rescue Co. 3: 515 West 181st Street
3) Washington Bridge Station Post Office: 555 West 180th Street
4) George Washington Bridge Bus Terminal: 4211 Broadway
5) New York Public Library, Fort Washington Branch: 535 West 179th Street
6) Yeshiva University: 500 West 185th Street
7) Gregorio Luperon High School for Science and Mathematics: 516-20 West 181st St.
8) PS 132 - Juan Pablo Duarte School (K-5): 185 Wadsworth Avenue
9) PS 48 - Police Officer Michael J. Buczek School (K-4): 4360 Broadway
10) IS 528 - Bea Fuller Rodgers School (6-8): 180 Wadsworth Avenue